

PRECIPITATION ENHANCEMENT—
A SCIENTIFIC CHALLENGE

Edited by
Roscoe Braham, Jr.

Published by the American Meteorological Society

METEOROLOGICAL MONOGRAPHS

VOLUME 21

DECEMBER 1986

NUMBER 43

246/3204 INSTITUT
FÜR METEOROLOGIE U. KLIMATOLOGIE
UNIVERSITÄT HANNOVER
HERRENHAUSER STR. 2 • 3000 HANNOVER 71

PRECIPITATION ENHANCEMENT— A SCIENTIFIC CHALLENGE

Roscoe R. Braham, Jr., William A. Cooper, William R. Cotton, Robert D. Elliot,
John A. Flueck, J. Michael Fritsch, Abraham Gagin, Lewis O. Grant, Andrew J. Heymsfield,
Geoffrey E. Hill, George A. Isaac, John D. Marwitz, Harold D. Orville, Arthur L. Rangno,
Bernard A. Silverman, Paul L. Smith
Contributing Authors

Roscoe R. Braham, Jr.
Editor

Published by the American Meteorological Society
45 Beacon St., Boston, MA 02108

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Preface

Chapter 1. Precipitation Enhancement—A Scientific Challenge

—ROSCOE R. BRAHAM, JR. 1

ABSTRACT 1

1.1 Introduction 1

1.2 Technology outran science 1

1.3 Glaciogenic seeding—dynamic and static modes 2

1.4 Factors that have limited research progress 3

1.5 Looking forward 4

Acknowledgments 4

REFERENCES 4

Chapter 2. Static Mode Seeding of Summer Cumuli—A Review

—BERNARD A. SILVERMAN 7

ABSTRACT 7

2.1 Introduction 7

2.2 The physical hypothesis 7

2.3 Seedability 9

2.4 Seeding 11

2.4.1 *Dry ice* 11

2.4.2 *Silver iodide* 12

2.4.3 *Transport and dispersion* 13

2.5 Chain of physical events 15

2.6 Overview 19

2.7 A look to the future 20

Acknowledgments 20

REFERENCES 20

Chapter 3. Summer Cumulus Cloud Lifetime—Importance to Static Mode Seeding

—GEORGE A. ISAAC 25

ABSTRACT 25

3.1 Introduction 25

3.2 Importance 25

3.3 Observations 26

3.4 Conclusions 27

REFERENCES 28

Chapter 4. Ice Initiation in Natural Clouds

—WILLIAM A. COOPER 29

ABSTRACT 29

4.1 Introduction 29

4.2 Ice concentrations attributed to nucleation 29

4.2.1 *Variance* 29

4.2.2 *Geographic variability* 30

4.2.3 *Comparison to ice nucleus concentrations* 30

4.2.4 *Cumulus versus stratified clouds* 31

4.3 Implications for natural efficiency and seedability 31

Acknowledgments 32

REFERENCES 32

Chapter 5. Aggregates as Embryos in Seeded Clouds	
—ANDREW J. HEYMSFIELD	33
ABSTRACT	33
5.1 Introduction	33
5.2 Observations of precipitation embryos in seeded clouds	33
5.3 Aggregate formation interpreted from measurements and modeling studies	33
5.4 The role of aggregates in seeded clouds	36
5.5 Particle growth model	36
5.6 Results of model calculations	37
5.6.1 <i>Growth without aggregation</i>	37
5.6.2 <i>Growth with aggregation</i>	38
5.7 Discussion and conclusions	38
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	40
APPENDIX: Discussion of the Probability of Crystal Collisions	40
REFERENCES	41
Chapter 6: A Review of Dynamic-Mode Seeding of Summer Cumuli	
—HAROLD D. ORVILLE	43
ABSTRACT	43
6.1 Introduction	43
6.1.1 <i>Historical background</i>	43
6.1.2 <i>Various scenarios for dynamic seeding</i>	43
6.2 Physical evidence for microphysical and dynamical effects	46
6.2.1 <i>Tropical clouds</i>	46
6.2.2 <i>Extratropical clouds</i>	49
6.3 Numerical modeling efforts	51
6.3.1 <i>Tropical clouds</i>	51
6.3.2 <i>Extratropical clouds</i>	52
6.4 Statistical evidence	55
6.5 Critique and discussion of results	56
6.5.1 <i>Critique</i>	56
6.5.2 <i>Discussion and questions</i>	58
6.6 Strategy	59
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	60
REFERENCES	60
Chapter 7. Evaluation of “Static” and “Dynamic” Seeding Concepts through Analyses of Israeli II and FACE-2 Experiments	
—ABRAHAM GAGIN	63
ABSTRACT	63
7.1 Introduction	63
7.2 Evaluation of the basic postulates of “static” seeding as inferred from analyses of Israeli II	63
7.2.1 <i>General remarks</i>	63
7.2.2 <i>The effect of seeding on the components of rainfall</i>	65
7.2.3 <i>Results</i>	66
7.2.4 <i>Downwind displacement of seeding effects</i>	69
7.2.5 <i>Concluding remarks—“static” mode seeding</i>	70
7.3 Evaluation of the basic tenets of “dynamic” seeding as inferred from an analysis of FACE-2	70

7.3.1	<i>General remarks</i>	70
7.3.2	<i>Methodology of radar-volume-scan observations</i>	70
7.3.3	<i>Regression analyses of the data</i>	71
7.3.4	<i>The data and description of the analytical approach</i>	71
7.3.5	<i>Results</i>	72
7.4	Concluding remarks	75
	REFERENCES	75

Chapter 8. Modification of Mesoscale Convective Weather Systems

	—J. MICHAEL FRITSCH	77
	ABSTRACT	77
8.1	Introduction	77
8.2	Interaction of moist convection with its environment	78
8.2.1	<i>Cloud-forced changes in the mesoscale environment</i>	78
8.2.2	<i>Secondary modification: Impact of alteration of the mesoscale environment on cloud characteristics</i>	80
8.3	Mesoscale modification experiments	80
8.3.1	<i>STORMFURY</i>	80
8.3.2	<i>The Florida Area Cumulus Experiment (FACE)</i>	81
8.3.3	<i>Other studies</i>	83
8.4	Concluding remarks	84
	<i>Acknowledgments</i>	84
	REFERENCES	84

Chapter 9. Review of Wintertime Orographic Cloud Seeding

	—ROBERT D. ELLIOTT	87
	ABSTRACT	87
9.1	Early seeding projects	87
9.1.1	<i>Initial projects</i>	87
9.1.2	<i>Climax</i>	88
9.1.3	<i>Wolf Creek Pass Experiment</i>	89
9.1.4	<i>Colorado River Basin Pilot Project</i>	89
9.1.5	<i>Vardiman–Moore composite analysis</i>	91
9.1.6	<i>The Santa Barbara Experiment</i>	91
9.1.7	<i>Extended area effects</i>	92
9.2	Observational and seeding systems	92
9.2.1	<i>Introduction</i>	92
9.2.2	<i>Precipitation gages</i>	92
9.2.3	<i>Rawinsondes</i>	92
9.2.4	<i>Microphysical data</i>	93
9.2.5	<i>Remote sensing</i>	93
9.2.6	<i>Other systems</i>	94
9.2.7	<i>Seeding systems</i>	94
9.2.8	<i>Tracers</i>	95
9.3	Models	95
9.3.1	<i>Ludlam's model</i>	95
9.3.2	<i>Quantitative orographic models</i>	95
9.4	New generation projects	96
9.4.1	<i>General</i>	96
9.4.2	<i>SCPP</i>	97

9.4.3 COSE	98
9.4.4 Utah Federal-State Project	99
9.5 Basic problems	100
Acknowledgments	101
REFERENCES	101
Chapter 10. Hypotheses for the Climax Wintertime Orographic Cloud Seeding Experiments	
—LEWIS O. GRANT	105
ABSTRACT	105
10.1 Introduction	105
10.2 Hypotheses for the Climax experiments	105
10.3 Phase I: Climax I (1960–65)	106
10.4 Phase II: Climax II (1965–70)	106
10.5 Phase III: Latter part of Climax II (1968–70)	107
10.6 Phase IV: Physical studies of Colorado orographic clouds and seeding hypotheses (1978-present)	107
10.7 Basic conclusions from tests of these hypotheses	107
REFERENCES	108
Chapter 11. A Comparison of Winter Orographic Storms over the San Juan Mountains and the Sierra Nevada	
—JOHN MARWITZ	109
ABSTRACT	109
11.1 Introduction	109
11.2 Comparison of San Juan and Sierra Nevada storms	109
11.3 Implications for seeding	112
Acknowledgments	113
REFERENCES	113
Chapter 12. How Good Are Our Conceptual Models of Orographic Cloud Seeding?	
—ARTHUR L. RANGNO	115
ABSTRACT	115
12.1 Introduction	115
12.2 Brief summary of recent findings	115
12.2.1 Ice particle concentrations in clouds	115
12.2.2 Ice nuclei	116
12.2.3 Variability of clouds and winds during storms	117
12.2.4 Temporal variations in precipitation	117
12.2.5 Fine-scale gradients in orographic precipitation	118
12.2.6 Targeting clouds with modification potential	119
12.3 Conceptual models of clouds over mountains	119
12.4 Some further comments relating to sampling and seeding	122
12.5 Conclusions	124
Acknowledgments	124
REFERENCES	124
Chapter 13. Seedability of Winter Orographic Clouds	
—GEOFFREY E. HILL	127
ABSTRACT	127

13.1 Introduction	127
13.2 Analysis of seedability	128
13.2.1 Seedability definitions	128
13.2.2 Distribution of supercooled liquid water	128
13.2.3 Relationship of supercooled liquid water to storm stage	131
13.2.4 Relationship of supercooled liquid water to meteorological factors	132
13.2.5 Factors governing seedability	132
13.2.6 Application of seeding criteria	135
13.3 Conclusions	136
Acknowledgments	136
REFERENCES	136

Chapter 14. Testing, Implementation, and Evolution of Seeding Concepts—A Review

—WILLIAM R. COTTON

ABSTRACT	139
14.1 Introduction	139
14.2 Testing, implementation, and evolution of warm cloud seeding concepts	139
14.2.1 Water droplet seeding	139
14.2.2 Hygroscopic particle seeding	139
14.3 Testing, implementation, and evolution of “static seeding” concepts in supercooled clouds	140
14.3.1 Stable orographic clouds	140
14.3.2 Supercooled cumuli	142
14.4 Testing, implementation, and evolution of concepts for “dynamic seeding” of cumuli	145
14.5 Concluding remarks	147
Acknowledgments	147
REFERENCES	147

Chapter 15. An Engineer’s View on the Implementation and Testing of Seeding Concepts

—PAUL L. SMITH

ABSTRACT	151
15.1 Introduction	151
15.2 Opportunity recognition	151
15.3 Treatment	152
15.4 Evaluation	153
REFERENCES	154

Chapter 16. Principles and Prescriptions for Improved Experimentation in Precipitation Augmentation Research

—JOHN A. FLUECK

ABSTRACT	155
16.1 Introduction	155
16.2 General research considerations	155
16.2.1 General objectives	155
16.2.2 Believable answers	156
16.2.3 Types of field studies	157
16.3 The stages, components, and classes of an experiment	157
16.3.1 The stages	157
16.3.2 The components	157

16.3.3	<i>The intersection</i>	159
16.3.4	<i>The classes</i>	160
16.4	Prescriptions for improved experimentation	161
16.4.1	<i>Conceptual models</i>	161
16.4.2	<i>Treatment design</i>	162
16.4.3	<i>Treatment effect models and analyses</i>	165
16.5	Summary and concluding remarks	169
	REFERENCES	169